

# **Biomethane from Dairy Waste**

## **A Sourcebook for the Production and Use of Renewable Natural Gas in California**

Prepared for Western United Dairymen  
Michael Marsh, Chief Executive Officer

Research Manager  
Ken Krich

Authors:  
Ken Krich  
Don Augenstein  
JP Batmale  
John Benemann  
Brad Rutledge  
Dara Salour

Funded in part through  
USDA Rural Development

July 2005



# Table of Contents

	Page
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	ix
<b>Glossary</b> .....	xi
<b>Executive Summary</b> .....	1
<b>Chapter 1 Potential Biogas Supply from California Dairies</b> .....	<b>19</b>
California Dairy Industry .....	19
On-Farm Manure Management and Biogas Supply .....	21
On-Farm Manure Management Systems.....	21
Biogas Production Potential from California Dairies .....	22
Co-Digestion of Dairy and Other Wastes .....	24
Crop Residues .....	24
Food Processing Waste .....	25
Slaughterhouse Waste and Rendering Plant Wastewater .....	25
Green Waste from Municipal/Commercial Collection Programs .....	27
Conclusions Regarding Co-Digestion .....	27
<b>Chapter 2: Production of Biogas by Anaerobic Digestion</b> .....	<b>29</b>
Elements of Anaerobic Digestion Systems.....	29
Anaerobic Digestion Technologies Suitable for Dairy Manure .....	31
Ambient-Temperature Covered Lagoon.....	32
Complete-Mix Digester .....	32
Plug-Flow Digester.....	32
Factors Influencing Anaerobic Digestion Efficiency .....	33
Environmental Impacts of Anaerobic Digestion .....	34
Reduced Greenhouse Gases Emissions .....	34
Reduced Volatile Organic Compound Emissions.....	35
Increased Nitrogen Oxide Emissions.....	36
Control of Unpleasant Odors.....	37
Control of Pathogens and Weed Seeds .....	37
Improved Water Quality .....	38
Motivation for Realizing Environmental Benefits on Dairy Farms .....	38
Increasing the Methane Content of Biogas.....	39
Pretreatment Techniques .....	39
Microbial Stimulants .....	40
Co-Digestion with Other Waste Sources .....	40
Effluent Absorption of Carbon Dioxide .....	42
Centralized Digestion of Dairy Wastes for Biogas Production .....	43
Centralized Digesters and Gas Production .....	43
Transport of Manure and Digested Effluent to Centralized Digesters .....	44
<b>Chapter 3 Upgrading Dairy Biogas to Biomethane and Other Fuels</b> .....	<b>47</b>
Upgrading Biogas to Biomethane .....	47
Technologies for Removal of Hydrogen Sulfide from Biogas.....	47
Technologies for Removal of Water Vapor .....	51

Technologies for Removal of Carbon Dioxide .....	51
Environmental Effects of Gas Cleanup Technologies .....	59
Possible Design for Small Dairy Biomethane Plant .....	60
Blending Biogas with More Valuable Fuels .....	63
Compressing Biomethane .....	63
Converting Biomethane to Non-Cryogenic Liquid Fuels.....	63
Methane-Reforming and Catalytic Conversion Processes .....	64
Biomethane to Gasoline Using the Fischer-Tropsch Process .....	64
Biomethane to Methanol.....	65
Biogas or Biomethane to Hydrogen Fuel.....	66
Converting Biomethane to Liquefied Biomethane .....	67
<b>Chapter 4 Storage and Transportation of Biogas and Biomethane.....</b>	<b>71</b>
Storage Systems and Costs.....	71
Biogas Storage.....	72
Biomethane Storage .....	73
Distribution of Biomethane.....	76
Distribution via Dedicated Biomethane Pipelines .....	77
Distribution via the Natural Gas Pipeline Network .....	77
Over-the-Road Transportation of Compressed Biomethane.....	78
Over-the-Road Transportation of Liquefied Biomethane .....	78
<b>Chapter 5 Potential Uses of Biogas and Biomethane .....</b>	<b>81</b>
Potential On-Farm Uses of Biogas .....	81
Biogas as a Fuel for Combined Heat and Power Applications .....	82
Alternative Uses of Biogas .....	88
Summary of On-Farm Demand for Biogas.....	93
Potential On-Farm and Off-Farm Uses of Biomethane .....	95
Non-Vehicular Uses of Biomethane.....	95
Vehicular Uses of Biomethane .....	96
Summary of On-Farm Demand for Biomethane .....	105
<b>Chapter 6 Government Policies and Incentives .....</b>	<b>107</b>
Policy Responses to Environmental Issues .....	108
Environmental Regulation .....	108
Market-Based Incentives for Emission Control.....	110
Promotion of Environmentally Beneficial Technologies .....	112
Government Policies and Incentives for Renewable Energy .....	112
Federal Support for Biomass Energy Sources .....	112
California Renewable Energy Programs .....	116
Government Policies and Incentives for Alternative Fuels .....	118
Federal Policies and Incentives for Alternative Fuels .....	119
California Alternative Fuel Programs.....	121
Government Policies and Incentives for Alternative Fuel Vehicles .....	124
Federal Policies and Incentives for Alternative Fuel Vehicles.....	124
California Programs Alternative Fuel Vehicles .....	127
Summary and Conclusions.....	130

<b>Chapter 7</b>	<b>Permits and Regulations for a Dairy Biomethane Plant</b>	<b>133</b>
	Permits for a Biogas Upgrading Plant	133
	Water Permits	134
	Air Emission Permits	136
	Hazardous Waste Regulations	137
	California Environmental Quality Act Requirements	137
	Local Land Use Regulations	137
	Permits for a Centralized Upgrading Facility	138
	Permitting and Regulation of Biomethane Storage and Transport	138
	On-Vehicle Storage Systems	138
	Transportation of Biomethane	141
<b>Chapter 8</b>	<b>Financial Analysis of Biomethane Production</b>	<b>147</b>
	Biogas and Biomethane as Commercial Products	147
	Electricity Markets	147
	Natural Gas Markets	150
	Comparison of Natural Gas and Electricity Prices	152
	Estimated Costs for a Dairy Anaerobic Digester Facility	153
	Basic System Components	153
	Cost Range for Dairy Anaerobic Digester and Electrical Generation Facility	153
	Cost Range for Dairy Digester and Biogas Upgrading Facility	154
	Summary of Financial Challenges to Building a Biomethane Plant	162
<b>Chapter 9</b>	<b>Developing a Biomethane Industry</b>	<b>165</b>
	Lessons from Sweden	165
	Why Should the Public Support the Biomethane Industry?	166
	Energy Independence and Renewable Fuel	166
	Future Fuel Shortages and Increased Prices for Fossil Fuels	167
	Environmental Benefits	168
	Eight Steps to a Successful Biomethane Enterprise	169
	Step 1: Find a Buyer for the Biomethane	169
	Step 2: Obtain Feedstock for the Anaerobic Digester	170
	Step 3: Determine Means of Transport	171
	Step 4: Locate the Upgrading Plant	172
	Step 5: Select a Technology and Prepare an Operating Plan	172
	Step 6: Develop a Financial Model and Locate Potential Financing	173
	Step 7: Identify Permitting Requirements and Develop a Permitting Plan	173
	Step 8: Select a Designer and Contractor and Build the Facility	174
	Five Possible Biomethane Plant Projects	174
	Project 1: Support Community Vehicle Fleet that Uses Compressed Biomethane	174
	Project 2: Sell Biomethane Directly to Large Industrial Customer	175
	Project 3: Distribute Biomethane through Natural Gas Pipeline Grid	176
	Project 4: Build Liquefied Biomethane Plant	176
	Project 5: Use Compressed Biomethane to Generate Peak-Load Electricity	177
<b>References</b>		<b>179</b>

## List of Figures

	<b>Page</b>
Figure 2-1 A dairy farm anaerobic digestion system .....	31
Figure 2-2 Simplified process of biogas production .....	31
Figure 3-1 Carbon dioxide absorption towers at the King County South Wastewater Treatment Plant.....	53
Figure 3-2 Schematic of a pressure swing absorption system with carbon molecular sieves for upgrading biogas .....	55
Figure 3-3 Cirmac amine carbon dioxide absorption process (LP Coaab™) for upgrading biogas.....	56
Figure 3-4 Schematic of Puente Hills landfills gas carbon dioxide-methane separation process .....	57
Figure 3-5 Carbon dioxide scrubbing process developed by Acrion Technologies .....	59
Figure 3-6 Water scrubbing process to remove carbon dioxide from biogas without regeneration .....	62
Figure 3-7 Skid-mounted 225-gpd landfill gas liquefaction Hartland Unit. ....	69
Figure 4-1 Schematic of on-farm storage system for compressed biomethane .....	74
Figure 4-2 Schematic of storage system for liquefied biomethane .....	76
Figure 5-1 Principles of two-piston Stirling engine .....	87

## List of Tables

	<b>Page</b>
Table 1-1 Recent Trends in the California Dairy Industry: More Cows, Fewer Dairies .....	20
Table 1-2 Number of Cows in California's Dairies, 2003 .....	20
Table 1-3 Potential Daily Methane Production from California Dairies .....	23
Table 1-4 Potential Methane Generation from Biomass Sources, California.....	26
Table 2-1 Characteristics of Anaerobic Digesters Suitable for On-Farm Use.....	32
Table 2-2 Modeled Comparison of Biogas Generation Potential of Three Different Anaerobic Digestion Processes on Typical 1,000-Cow Dairy Merced, CA Dairy.....	33
Table 2-3 Theoretical Methane Content of Biogas .....	41
Table 2-4 Operational Parameters for Three Swedish Biogas Plants .....	42
Table 3-1 Components for Typical Small Biogas Upgrading Plant.....	61
Table 4-1 On-Farm Storage Options for Biogas and Biomethane .....	72
Table 5-1 Compressed Natural Gas Fuel Specifications vs. Typical Raw Biogas Composition .....	93
Table 5-2 Potential Annual Demand for Raw and Cleaned Biogas, Typical 1,000-Cow Dairy Farm.....	94
Table 5-3 California Market for Compressed-Natural-Gas-Fueled Vehicles.....	97
Table 5-4 California Market for Liquefied-Natural-Gas-Fueled Vehicles .....	98
Table 5-5 Summary of California Market for Natural-Gas-Fueled Vehicles .....	100
Table 5-6 Estimated Annual CNG and LNG Vehicle Consumption in California, 2004.....	101
Table 5-7 Potential Annual Vehicle Fuel Demand for Typical 1,000-Cow Dairy .....	102
Table 5-8 Companies Performing Vehicle Conversions to Compressed Natural Gas Fuel, Western USA.....	105
Table 5-9 Potential Annual Demand for Biomethane, Typical 1,000-Cow Dairy Farm .....	106
Table 6-1 Federal Policies and Programs that Encourage Alternative Fuels, Ranked According to Presumed Impact on Growth of Biomethane Industry.....	120
Table 6-2 California Policies and Programs that Encourage Alternative Fuels, Ranked According to Presumed Impact on Growth of Biomethane Industry.....	122
Table 6-3 Federal Policies and Programs that Encourage Use of Alternative Fuel Vehicles, Ranked According to Presumed Impact on Growth of Biomethane Industry .....	125

Table 6-4	California Programs that Promote the Use of Alternative Fuel Vehicles.....	128
Table 7-1	Permitting Information for Biogas Upgrading Plant .....	134
Table 7-2	Summary of Major Safety Standards for Compressed and Liquefied Natural Gas Vehicles .....	140
Table 7-3	Basic Pipeline Quality Standards for Major California Distributors .....	143
Table 8-1	Average Price of Natural Gas for PG&E Small Commercial Users, 2000 – 2005 .....	150
Table 8-2	Natural Gas Wellhead, City-Gate, and Distribution Prices (Current Price and Historical Highs and Lows from 2000 through 2005) .....	151
Table 8-3	Natural Gas to Electricity Conversion at Various Efficiency Rates.....	152
Table 8-4	Estimated Costs of Generating Electricity from Biogas Produced on a Typical 1,000-Cow Dairy .....	154
Table 8-5	Operating Parameters and Associated Costs for Four Swedish Biogas to Biomethane Plants.....	157
Table 8-6	Estimated Costs for Three Hypothetical Dairy Biogas to Biomethane Plants .....	157
Table 8-7	Estimated Costs for Three Hypothetical Dairy Anaerobic Digester and Biogas to Biomethane Plant .....	158
Table 8-8	Estimated Inputs, Outputs and Associated Costs for Large Dairy Digester, Generator, and Liquefied Biomethane Facility.....	159
Table 8-9	Estimated Range of Costs for Dairy Digester and Biogas to Biomethane Plant.....	161
Table 8-10	Estimated Biomethane Production and Distribution Costs Compared to Current Natural Gas Prices .....	162

## Appendices

	Page
<b>Appendix A Stoichiometry of the Anaerobic Digestion Process.....</b>	<b>A-1</b>
Two-Phase Anaerobic Digestion .....	A-2
Removal of Carbon Dioxide During the Digestion Process.....	A-4
Conclusions .....	A-6
<b>Appendix B Detailed Description of the Three Main Dairy Digester Technologies.....</b>	<b>B-1</b>
Description of Covered Lagoon Digester.....	B-1
Components of Covered-Lagoon Digester .....	B-3
Covered-Lagoon Design Variables .....	B-3
Operation and Maintenance of Covered-Lagoon Digester .....	B-7
Description of Plug-Flow Digester .....	B-7
Components of Plug-Flow Digester.....	B-8
Design Criteria and Sizing the Plug-Flow Digester .....	B-8
Description of Complete-Mix Digester .....	B-9
Components of Complete-Mix Digester.....	B-10
Complete-Mix Digester Design Criteria .....	B-11
Operation and Maintenance of Complete-Mix and Plug-Flow Digesters .....	B-12
<b>Appendix C Conversion of Biogas to Biomethanol.....</b>	<b>C-1</b>
Past Unrealized Projects.....	C-1
The Smithfield Foods Utah Project: From Hog Manure to Biodiesel .....	C-1

<b>Appendix D</b>	<b>Compressed Natural Gas and Liquefied Natural Gas Vehicles</b>	
	<b>Available in California</b> .....	<b>D-1</b>
	CNG Vehicles .....	D-1
	Light-Duty CNG Vehicles .....	D-1
	Medium- and Heavy-Duty CNG Vehicles .....	D-2
	LNG Vehicle Types .....	D-5
<b>Appendix E</b>	<b>Energy Contents / Equivalences for Natural Gas Fuels versus Electricity</b> .....	<b>E-1</b>
<b>Appendix F</b>	<b>Cost of Building Dairy Anaerobic Digesters per Kilowatt</b> .....	<b>F-1</b>
<b>Appendix G</b>	<b>Linking Potential Biomethane Production with Possible Off-Farm Markets in California’s Central Valley: Geographic Case Studies</b> .....	<b>G-1</b>
	Selection Criteria for Regional Focus .....	G-1
	Concentration of Dairies.....	G-1
	Regional Demand for Compressed Natural Gas as a Transportation Fuel .....	G-3
	Summary of Reasons for Selecting San Joaquin Valley as Geographic Focus .....	G-4
	Data Sources.....	G-4
	Dairies .....	G-4
	Demand for Compressed Natural Gas .....	G-5
	Landfills and Wastewater Treatment Facilities .....	G-6
	Local Businesses with High Demand for Compressed Natural Gas.....	G-6
	Analysis of the Accuracy of Data Collected .....	G-6
	Determination of Viable Project Locations .....	G-7
	Initial Criteria: Nearby Fueling Stations.....	G-7
	Initial Site Rankings: Proximity to Dairies.....	G-7
	GIS Analysis: More In-depth Rankings .....	G-8
	Additional Data .....	G-11
	Description of Sites .....	G-13
	Site #1: City of Tulare, FleetStar .....	G-13
	Site #2: Visalia SoCal Gas, FleetStar.....	G-16
	Site #3: Kings County Yard/PFC.....	G-19
	Site #4.....	G-20
	Conclusion and Further Study .....	G-23
	Appendix G References.....	G-25
	Annex G1: Characteristics of Dairy Industry in the San Joaquin Valley.....	G-26
	Annex G2: Data Accuracy.....	G-27
	Annex G3: CNG Filling Stations .....	G-31
	Annex G4: Analysis of Sites 5 through 8 .....	G-32
	Annex G5: Southern California Edison Service Territory .....	G-37
	Annex G6: Wastewater Treatment Plants.....	G-38
	Annex G7: Landfills and Disposal Sites .....	G-41

## **Acknowledgements**

### **Program Manager**

*Michael Marsh*, Chief Executive Officer,  
Western United Dairymen

### **Research Manager**

*Ken Krich*, Sustainable Conservation

### **Authors**

*Ken Krich*, Sustainable Conservation

*Don Augenstein*, Institute for Environmental  
Management, Inc.

*J.P. Batmale*, Renewable Energy Project  
Manager, Great Valley Center

*John Benemann, Ph.D.*, President and Chief  
Executive Officer, Institute for  
Environmental Management, Inc.

*Brad Rutledge*, Project Manager, WestStart-  
CalStart

*Dara Salour*, RCM Digesters, Inc.

### **Contributing Author**

*Jim Wright*, Lyles Center for Innovation and  
Entrepreneurship, California State  
University, Fresno

### **Advisory Committee**

*Don Augenstein*, Institute for Environmental  
Management, Inc.

*J.P. Batmale*, Renewable Energy Project  
Manager, Great Valley Center

*John Benemann, Ph.D.*, President and Chief  
Executive Officer, Institute for  
Environmental Management, Inc.

*John Boesel*, President and Chief Executive  
Officer, WestStart-CalStart

*Jim Boyd*, Commissioner, California Energy  
Commission

*Susan Buller*, Senior Regulatory Analyst,  
Pacific Gas and Electric

*Allen Dusault*, Senior Project Manager,  
Sustainable Conservation

*Michael Hertel, Ph.D.*, Director of  
Environmental Policy, Southern  
California Edison

*Ken Krich*, Sustainable Conservation  
*Michael Marsh*, Chief Executive Officer,  
Western United Dairymen

*Paul Martin*, Director of Environmental  
Programs, Western United Dairymen

*Mark Moser*, President, RCM Digesters, Inc.

*George Simons*, Manager, Renewable  
Energy and Public Interest Energy  
Research, California Energy  
Commission

*Ichiro Sugioka, Ph.D.*, Aerodynamics and  
Scientific Research, Volvo Monitoring  
and Concepts Center

*Matt Summers*, Air Resources Engineer,  
California Department of Food and  
Agriculture

*Rob Williams*, Development Engineer, UC  
Davis, Department of Bio and  
Agricultural Engineering

*Bill Zeller*, Program Manager, Clean Air  
Transportation, Pacific Gas and Electric

*Ruihong Zhang, Ph.D.*, Associate Professor,  
Department of Biological and  
Agricultural Engineering, University of  
California at Davis

### **Technical Editor**

*Konnie Andrews*, Clear Concepts

### **Document Publishing**

*Kathleen Reuter*, Western United Dairymen

*Kathi Schiffler*, Western United Dairymen

### **Project Funding**

*This study was funded in part through the  
Value-Added Agricultural Product Market  
Development Grant Program, administered  
by USDA Rural Development.*

